

Head to Head: MacDonald Reid Debate

by Yvonne MacKean

On Feb 7, the annual MacDonald-Reid Debate took place. This debate takes place between PEI and Holland College. The trophy was donated by St. Dunstan's Class of '54 in recognition of the teams of Alan MacDonald and Walter Reid, who won the Canadian Dominion Debating Championships in 1954. The resolution was "A Maritime Union is a fundamental necessity for the survival of the Maritime provinces." UPEI debated the affirmative with speakers David Saunders and Garry MacDonald. Holland College, as opposition, was represented by Anna Shoyer and Anthony Ring. Moderating the debate was UPEI Alumna Valerie Moore. Judging the debate was Patricia Della (Opposition Leader), Colin Jackson (Director of the Confederation Centre of the Arts) and Gary

MacDougall (Editor of the *Guardian*).

The opening speech by Saunders of UPEI presented a plan to unite the three Maritime provinces. He outlined the problems currently, and how amalgamation into "one strong voice" would benefit all. Saunders appealed to facts and figures to support his case.

Holland College's first remarks were delivered by Shoyer in a well prepared speech. Shoyer approached the question on a more emotional basis. Her arguments against the union involved primarily the loss of each province's individuality. She also brought up issues regarding the quality of services in one province.

MacDonald spoke next for UPEI. In his ten minutes, he ad-

ressed some of the main themes of Shoyer's speech. MacDonald provided Cape Breton as an example to show that union did not necessarily mean the loss of identity, as Cape Breton is part of Nova Scotia. MacDonald also argued that an economic union would not suffice, a full political union was necessary.

Ring then took to the podium. He had a very light manner about him and highlighted several points against the union proposal. His main thrust was on the possibility that PEI may get the short end of the stick in education, services and representation because of its small population.

At this point there was a five minute break to prepare a final summation. MacDonald began, reiterating several key points and

also summed up the opposition's case as one built on fear. Holland College's summation was by Shoyer, who pointed out several arguments against the idea of union in her speech. Following the summations, the judges retired to make their decision and questions for the debaters were entertained. The judges returned momentarily with their decision.

After the comments and remarks by the judges, the anxious debaters were told the result. The judges, by a narrow margin, awarded the MacDonald-Reid Cup to UPEI! As a result, UPEI has held the trophy for the last four years. Thanks to all participants and to the spectators who came out. Hopefully next year's rematch will be as exciting!

MCAATTC MINGLEWOOD

at the Barn

ALL WET

Thursday February 15
Tickets \$5

Advance Tickets Available at Student Union