

Liberal "Model Budget"

(Continued from Page 1)

which we received in 1912 under the Premiership of the present Chief Justice of the Province was an actual payment based on our claims which were really then, for the first time, presented in their full form.

THE DUNCAN COMMISSION

"In 1926 the Duncan Commission recommended an interim increase of \$125,000. My hon. friends say that we owe this to the Duncan report and that we would never have had the Duncan report if Parliament had listened to the Conservative members at Ottawa, who, they say, opposed the appointment of that Commission. Now, Mr. Speaker, I shall not attempt to go into the whole of this question of Maritime claims, which is necessary to an understanding of where the credit lies, and where the blame for delay and political participation rests. I need only refer to the reference made by the member from Tignish in an editorial in a Halifax Conservative newspaper, and recall the attitude of the Liberal press in Halifax when the Maritime claims were first talked about. Anyone who knows the history of the Maritime claims movement knows that the success which it achieved was due to the Conservative newspapers and to the concerted efforts on the part of the Conservative members of Parliament and the Maritimes. If any hon. member doubts this statement, let him go to Hansard for those years preceding the appointment of the Duncan Commission, and he will see where they were after a Conservative speaker after speaker rose and demanded this with a united voice until they got action from the Mackenzie King Government.

Criticized by Liberals

"The attitude of the Government leader at that time may be judged from the doubt which Mr. King expressed, in a veiled way, as to the existence of Maritime rights. In the circumstances, it was not surprising that the Conservatives viewed with suspicion the attitude of the King Government when the suggestion of appointing a Commission was made. But I will say this: the Duncan report is a valuable document. The appointment was splendidly made—through the Liberal politicians in the Maritime Provinces suggested that they were not interfered with and were not allowed to consider such questions as the tariffs. The present Premier of Nova Scotia went so far as to suggest that the Government of Canada had not given the Commission a free hand.

The Interim Report

"It is, however, difficult for anyone who has studied the Commission's instructions to understand why they did not bring in a final report. I have never had it expressed to my satisfaction. They expressed their inability to deal with the claims of the Maritime Provinces and to set a valuation on them, and so they recommended an interim subsidy increase, pending a full valuation and settlement. The interim subsidy was one that might be increased or decreased; there was no definite commitment of the Government to the payment of this amount for all time. The former leader of the Liberal Government in this Province expressed that idea in discussing the question of our claims in this Legislature, when he pointed out that although they were going to press the matter at Ottawa, there was danger that this \$125,000 interim increase would be cut down.

"I have dealt with this matter for this reason, that members of the Opposition have criticized the use of the press of the figures \$275,000 as representing the measure of our accomplishment in the matter of annual subsidy increase under the White Commission. Those figures, (which are the figures used in the Commissioner's report) are not correct. As to the \$125,000 interim increase under the Duncan report, we have planned that sum where it is no longer in danger of being reduced, and we have obtained \$150,000 annual subsidy increase in addition. Therefore it is not incorrect to say that our measure of accomplishment was \$275,000. I am quite sure there was no intention of misrepresenting the figures by suggesting that we were going to get that much more than was recommended under the Duncan report. Rather, it was to clarify the situation by emphasizing the temporary nature of the interim award, and the fact that it was now placed on a permanent basis, and has been supplemented by \$150,000 of additional annual increase.

Tribute to Premier

"The leader of the Government has been so kind as to make some complimentary remarks regarding the presentation of my case. But I may say that there was no difficulty in presenting the case. If you have a good case, as we had—and if you have the will to present it. The task assigned to me was an easy task. The difficult task was the one assigned to the leader of the Government. It was by his vigour and untiring energy that he overcame the many obstacles." (Applause.)

Persistent Effort Made

"Incidentally, I might remind hon. members opposite that it was not on the eve of the election, as they contend, that this Government began to consider the matter of our subsidy claims. The document was first presented in the House in 1912, and I have pointed out where we are on this side of the House in the report on this interpretation." (Applause.)

The Matheson Presentation

"In 1907 we obtained another increase of \$70,000, but that was not on a basis of claim. We would have received that increase, I suggest, if the Province had not been represented at the negotiations at all, because that was a general subsidy. But the \$100,000 increase

the presentation that was made by the late Government at the conference in 1927."

Mr. McIntyre: "Did the other Premiers have anything to do with having a Commission appointed by the Dominion Government?"

Hon. Mr. MacPhee: "I was discussing the Interprovincial Conference of 1927. Is that what the hon. member is referring to?"

Mr. McIntyre: "I mean the White Commission."

Hon. Mr. MacPhee: "The other Maritime representatives co-operated to the utmost. This is another thing for which we must commend our Premier; that without difficulty he could get these people to co-operate with him." (Applause.)

THE BLANK YEARS

"Between the years 1927, when the presentation was made by all the Provinces at the Dominion-Provincial Conference, and 1930, when the Audit Board was appointed, there does not appear to have been anything done. Doc, the leader of the Opposition or anyone associated with him suggest that that situation was owing to any lack of co-operation by Nova Scotia and New Brunswick? The answer will be most interesting.

Quotes Audit Board

The Premiers of Nova Scotia and New Brunswick knew just as well as did the members of the Board of Trade in Charlottetown that the Audit Board had no legislative authority; and this was the result as reported by the Audit Board itself:

"We have reviewed the various aspects of Federal, Provincial and Municipal taxation, the effect and their relation to each other, and as a result the Board of Audit do not consider that they are in a position to advise finally as to an equitable reassessment of the subsidies of the three Maritime Provinces before a complete investigation is made into the various forms of taxation which prevail throughout Canada."

THAT "IDEAL" BUDGET

"But I must not forget that there was a presentation made to the Dominion Audit Board by the Liberal Government of this Province. I have here the Board's report, made to the Dominion Government. Attached to it is a memorandum filed by the Liberal Government of this Province at that time. It is designated "Ideal Budget for Ten Years, presented by Prince Edward Island." The member from Tignish (Mr. T. A. Campbell) referred in his speech to this model report as an "ideal budget," as a "minimum budget." He has adopted that word since we used it before the White Commission with reference to our claim on the ground of "minimum" fiscal need. But never did we hear it applied to the budget they presented to the Audit Board. They were asked to present an "ideal" budget, and not a "minimum" one, that they presented." (Applause.)

LEA DEFICIT ADMITTED

"This report of the Audit Board is an interesting document, and it is one that the House will study with a great deal of benefit. For the Duncan report, rather, it throws light upon the question of Liberal financing. You will recall, Mr. Speaker, the quotation which was read by the Premier from a speech of the leader of the Opposition delivered at a political meeting at York, in which the statement was made that 'the difference between the two budgets was that the Liberal Government had balanced their budgets.' The Audit Board report, which is dated Oct. 8, 1930, makes reference to this very matter; and this is what it says:

The Provinces of Nova Scotia and Prince Edward Island showed DEFICITS in their Public Accounts for the last fiscal year, and the Province of New Brunswick showed a slight surplus."

"Mr. Speaker," continued Mr. MacPhee, amid loud applause; "we couldn't convince the leader of the Opposition that he had a deficit at that time, but here we have it in black and white, in the report which the Board of Audit presented to the Dominion Government. Perhaps, after all that, the expenditures incurred by that Board, and the trip of these gentlemen to Ottawa at that time, were not altogether wasted, if they will have served to convince the Opposition leader, even as to one small point."

SOMEbody WRONG

"It was suggested by the member from Tignish (Mr. T. A. Campbell) on the one hand that the White Commission inquiry represented the final and complete negotiations, and on the other, that Audit Board

in 1930 had exactly the same authority as the White Commission of 1935. Yet I note that the Audit Board insists that they were not in a position to make any final determination or assessment. Possibly this is wrong. Possibly the White Commission is wrong. I would not suggest for a moment that the member from Tignish is wrong." (Loud laughter.)

Trade Board Sceptical

"Nova Scotia and New Brunswick knew that the Audit Board could not deal with their claims, and everybody else knew it too. Will my hon. friends recall the time that that famous 'pamphlet' appeared in the Liberal press, with the \$3,000,000 subsidy claim? Do they recollect what produced the issuance of that? Does the leader of the Opposition recollect the proposed meeting of the Charlottetown Board of Trade and the address by Senator Hughes at that time? He was going to how a great big claim, just when my hon. friends were going up to Ottawa with a claim for some \$400,000; and, presto! this \$3,000,000 claim suddenly appeared in the Patriot. But the Board of Trade did not discuss this very thing, but had expressed the opinion that the Audit Board was not the tribunal which could deal with it, and that the proper method would be to have a Commission appointed. 'What a wonderful thing it would be,' it was suggested, 'if we could get a Commission appointed and have it Justice Matheson on it.' I attended that meeting, and recall the suggestion very clearly.

Quotes Audit Board

"We have reviewed the various aspects of Federal, Provincial and Municipal taxation, the effect and their relation to each other, and as a result the Board of Audit do not consider that they are in a position to advise finally as to an equitable reassessment of the subsidies of the three Maritime Provinces before a complete investigation is made into the various forms of taxation which prevail throughout Canada."

"GROSSLY UNDERPAID"

"The most interesting feature of the Audit Board's report is the memorandum submitted by the Government of this Province at that time. It is dated, as I said, Oct. 8, 1930. In dealing with the difficult financial position in which the Province found itself, it states:

"The Province has only two sources of revenue—Federal subsidy and direct taxation—having no Crown Lands, no minerals, no industries, no natural resources, no sources of taxation and agricultural products."

Were They Sincere?

"If they had said they were 'no more than sufficiently paid,' we could understand their position. If they had said they were 'somewhat underpaid,' the suggestion of a readjustment in view of the depression would at least have been intelligible. But that they were 'grossly underpaid' in 1930, and 'grossly underpaid' in 1932, is a situation the solution of which baffles all understanding." (Loud applause.)

"NO GRAVEL"

"That, of course, is only a minor item when we consider it in relation to one that I have reserved here for the ex-Minister of Public Works. He does not know whether he put this in the 'Model Budget' or not, but it says:

"Owing to the fact that we have NO GRAVEL in the Province, and the HIGH COST OF IMPORTING THE SAME, we have not a mile of permanent highways!" (Laughter.)

"There was some little discussion in this House about whether or not the ex-Minister during his administration, knew there was such a

thing as Island gravel. Now we have the evidence of his lack of knowledge in this memorandum filed with the Audit Board." (Applause.)

DISCLAIMS RESPONSIBILITY

Mr. McIntyre: "I may say that I am sure I did."

Hon. Mr. MacPhee: "I wonder if the hon. member knew that Island gravel was in existence in 1930, when this statement was prepared?"

Claims Premier Knew

Mr. McIntyre: "I guess the Premier knew about it."

Hon. Mr. MacPhee: "That makes it worse still. For the Premier, in his brief before the Audit Board, said: 'WE HAVE NO ISLAND GRAVEL IN THE PROVINCE!'" (Applause.)

OLD AGE PENSIONS

"But there is something else in this Model Budget of 1931 in which I am sure the House will be interested. After all these preliminaries—after pointing out that we were unable to provide for public health and child welfare, that our school teachers were grossly underpaid, that owing to having 'no gravel' and the high cost of importing the same we had not a mile of permanent highways—the memorandum proceeds:

"And it has been utterly impossible for us EVEN TO CONSIDER the introduction of Old Age Pensions." (Laughter.)

The Liberal "Joker"

Mr. Lea: "My hon. friend knows that Old Age Pensions was to be considered with revenue; that was our plan."

"GROSSLY UNDERPAID"

"The most interesting feature of the Audit Board's report is the memorandum submitted by the Government of this Province at that time. It is dated, as I said, Oct. 8, 1930. In dealing with the difficult financial position in which the Province found itself, it states:

"The Province has only two sources of revenue—Federal subsidy and direct taxation—having no Crown Lands, no minerals, no industries, no natural resources, no sources of taxation and agricultural products."

Were They Sincere?

"If they had said they were 'no more than sufficiently paid,' we could understand their position. If they had said they were 'somewhat underpaid,' the suggestion of a readjustment in view of the depression would at least have been intelligible. But that they were 'grossly underpaid' in 1930, and 'grossly underpaid' in 1932, is a situation the solution of which baffles all understanding." (Loud applause.)

"NO GRAVEL"

"That, of course, is only a minor item when we consider it in relation to one that I have reserved here for the ex-Minister of Public Works. He does not know whether he put this in the 'Model Budget' or not, but it says:

"Owing to the fact that we have NO GRAVEL in the Province, and the HIGH COST OF IMPORTING THE SAME, we have not a mile of permanent highways!" (Laughter.)

"There was some little discussion in this House about whether or not the ex-Minister during his administration, knew there was such a

Dresden Voile NIGHTGOWNS \$1. for Spring TAFFETA GOWNS Special at \$1.49 Lace trimmed Crepe de Chene Slips \$1.39 Two Way Stretch LASTEX GIRDLE \$1.49 Moore & McLeod Limited

PERSONALS

Mrs. Hillard Arthur of Summerside, is visiting her parents, Mr. and Mrs. R. V. MacIntyre, Charlottetown.

Mr. J. A. Prunty of the C. G. S. Arranmore spent two weeks holidays at his home in this city and left yesterday morning for Halifax, N. S.

Most Rev. John Richardson D.D., Archbishop of Fredericton, N.B., who has been attending the meetings of the Diocesan Church Society here, left yesterday morning on return to Fredericton.

The many friends of Miss Edith Stead are glad to know that she was successfully operated on in the P. E. Island Hospital for appendicitis.

Mrs. A. Rose MacDonalld formerly Miss Babe Mann, York was called to her old home in Kensington on Wednesday evening owing to the serious illness of her mother Mrs. Elizabeth Mann.

W. M. S. MEETING

On March 13th the Cavendish W. M. S. held their monthly meeting at the home of Mrs. J. R. Stewart and quite a number gathered despite the stormy day. The President, Mrs. W. A. Paterson led the devotional exercises. Roll call was answered by twelve members and four visitors. The word mighty was used. In the absence of the secretary, there were no minutes of last meeting. Business of the meeting was then taken up, committees heard from and correspondence read. Mrs. W. A. Paterson read a letter from the dried out area in Saskatchewan where they had received among other garments, a quilt, one of which was sent from the Cavendish auxiliary and was gratefully received. The next meeting to be held at the home of Mrs. Wesley Smith, roll call to be answered with the word union. Meeting closed by prayer in unison.

CONFEDERATION LIFE INSURANCE

L-6798-7-12-3121.

BIRTHDAY CELEBRATION

Mr. J. C. Stiers of Souris was receiving congratulations yesterday on the occasion of his 88th birthday.

MEN'S fancy cotton hose

at a pair. Prowse Bros., Ltd.

FOXES ESCAPE

Three valuable foxes escaped from the ranch of John Thompson. Two have been captured but considerable difficulty will be the third is still at large.

FUNERAL NOTICE

The remains of the late Malcolm Ferguson of Moncton, will arrive in Kensington Friday evening, and on Saturday will be conveyed to New London Cemetery. Interment at 2 p. m.

WANTED - A PRESSURE TANK

for water about 300 gallons. State size and price to C. E. Gamble, Albany. 7-5235-7-13-15-18-20-22.

WANTED FOR RAWLIGH

Route of 800 families. Write to Day, Rawligh, Dept. MLC-480-SA, Montreal, Canada. N-1859-3-2-8-15-22-29.

WANTED - A PRESSURE TANK

for water about 300 gallons. State size and price to C. E. Gamble, Albany. 7-5235-7-13-15-18-20-22.

SUBSCRIPTIONS TO THE

Guardian may be purchased through their Rept. Archie Hume phone 47, or left at H. J. Mabon's Drug Store, Montague. L-7

IN AID OF MONTAGUE

BAND a concert will be held in Odiflow Hall, Wednesday, March 27. Reserve seats for sale at Carruthers Store. L-5448-3-20-23-274

TOO LATE TO CLASSIFY

WANTED FOR RAWLIGH

Route of 800 families. Write to Day, Rawligh, Dept. MLC-480-SA, Montreal, Canada. N-1859-3-2-8-15-22-29.

Trinity United Church

FRIDAY, MARCH 22 100-Young People's Society-Social Hall.

MRS. WM. STEVENSON

The death of the late Mrs. Wm. Stevenson of Albion came as a great surprise to a wide circle of friends when it was learned that she had passed away Tuesday evening. Although in her eightieth year she was quite active and had practically the end when heart complications brought about a sudden collapse. The funeral was held from the Sturgeon Baptist Church Thursday afternoon, being conducted by Rev. C. U. MacNevin of Georgetown, and, although the day was cold, a large number of people gathered which quite filled the church. The message was based on the words of Elijah in Job, where he reminded the sufferer of "a shock of corn coming in in his season," and so, for a noble character, death is inevitable and orderly, and timely, and complete.

Mrs. Stevenson had lived a large number of her days in Charlottetown where her husband ran a small business on Great George St., but for the last few years, she had been at her old home keeping house for her brother. She is survived by the following brothers and sisters, James, William, Mrs. Clarey, Mrs. Graham and Mrs. Griffin.

DEATHS

At Orwell Cove, on March 21, 1935, Donald John Nicholson, aged 81. Funeral Saturday at 2 p. m. to Belfast Cemetery.

CAMPBELL—At Roxbury, Mass., March 20, 1935, Mrs. Jessie Campbell, dearly beloved wife of the late John J. Campbell of Cardigan, Remains will arrive by Saturday night's train and rest at the Undertaking Parlors of A. A. Hennessey, and will be forwarded on the afternoon train Monday to Cardigan. Funeral on Tuesday morning.

Card of Thanks

Mr. Colin Reeves and family of Lower Preetown wish to extend their sincere thanks to their neighbors and friends for their kindness shown to them in their recent sad bereavement.

SPECIAL at DEVEREAUX CASH GROCERY EXTRA SPECIAL CR. BUTTER CRANBERRIES 2 lbs. 29c LEMONS Dozen 25c BULK TEA 1 lb. 35c ONIONS 10 lbs. 19c TURNIPS 10 lbs. 25c GRAPES 2 lbs. 29c COOKING APPLES peck 39c BANANAS lb. 10c COOKIES 3 lbs. 29c KAYAK SALMON tin 19c HERRING (Labrador) each 5c All Kinds of Fresh and Smoked Fish DEVEREAUX CASH GROCERY PHONE 1210 FREE DELIVERY

Stop Your Cold Now! Dr. Wood's NORWAY PINE SYRUP STRIKES at the ROOT of COLDS and COUGHS